

## **Tawhidic Paradigm Index as a Measuring Tool of Tawhidic Practice: A Research in Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia**

**Halimi Mohd Khalid<sup>1</sup>, Azman Hasan<sup>2</sup>, Abdullah Sulaiman<sup>3</sup>, Shakila Ahmad<sup>4</sup>, and Hemmy Abd. Jalal<sup>5</sup>**

<sup>1</sup> Centre for General Studies and Co-curricular and Head of the Department of Ahl-Sunnah Wal Jamaah Institute, Universiti Teknologi Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia (UTHM), Johor, MALAYSIA

<sup>2</sup> Faculty of Technical and Vocational, Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia (UTHM, Johor, MALAYSIA

<sup>3,4</sup> Department of Islamic Studies, Centre for General Studies and Co-curricular, Universiti Teknologi Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia (UTHM), Johor, MALAYSIA

<sup>5</sup> Centre for Global Online Learning, Universiti Teknologi Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia (UTHM), Johor, MALAYSIA

\* [halimi@uthm.edu.my](mailto:halimi@uthm.edu.my)

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.30880/ahcs.2021.02.02.017>

Received 15 November 2021; Accepted 16 December 2021; Available online 30 December 2021

**Abstract:** The paradigm of Tauhid is a framework of world view that Allah SWT as al Khaliq and man as *al-makhluk*. This world view is based on the integrated relationship between God and man, man with man and man with nature. This relationship is based on three main cores, namely knowledge, faith and deeds through the appreciation of faith, sharia and morals to achieve happiness in this world and the hereafter. In general, this is a holistic and integrated concept in shaping the personal character of a noble human being. However, it is seen as too abstract to make it impossible to measure. In general, this is a holistic and integrated concept in shaping the personal character of a noble human being. However, it is seen as too abstract to make it impossible to measure and prove scientifically. Therefore, the Paradigm of Tauhid remains a slogan that is fought for but difficult to achieve. However, this research managed to prove that the tawhidic paradigm is in fact an abstract thinking framework that covers both theoretical and practical aspects. The reason for choosing this concept is because it is seen as packed in a holistic manner that includes the aim of humans' life that is to succeed in the world and hereafter. This writing intends to put forward a new innovation in the research of Tawhidic Paradigm that is; Tawhidic Paradigm Index (IPT). IPT is a measurement tool to designate the percentage or the value of Tawhidic practice in an organisation mainly a higher

learning institution in a form of statistical value. The index is unique because it is rabbani, universal, flexible and measurable. The research employed an empirical method and used Exploratory Sequential Mixed Method approach with four-phased research. The findings of the research hoped to assist organisations that incline towards the concept in measuring the extent of tawhidic paradigm practice in their respective organisation.

Keywords: Tawhidic Paradigm Index, Measuring Tool, Empirical research, Integration, Al-Falah

## 1. Introduction

Research on tawhidic paradigm is not uncommon among academicians. In fact, there is various research conducted in order to introduce the concept. It is seen as a successful tool to convey understanding to both researchers and the public to grasp a better understanding of the concept. The tendency to research and discuss the issue is largely due to its uniqueness that is holistic in nature.

Past research gave evidence of the holistic and stable nature of tawhidic paradigm. This concept was then implemented in various theoretical and practical fields which shows evidence on its flexibility to be paired with any field of studies. Nevertheless, there has been no empirical research aiming at measuring and evaluating the achievement of tawhidic paradigm implementation at organizational or institutional level. Therefore, this research has the purpose of introducing tawhidic paradigm index as a measuring tool to determine the extent of its effectiveness as a concept. Next, the index also can predetermine the issues emerged and suggest ways to overcome the issues [18].

Index had been used in previous research to present statistical reports. Specifically, for the research purpose, the researchers found various indexes developed by other users utilizing integrative methods. Amongst them are, Human Development Index, Life Quality Index, Happiness Index, The Meaning of Life Index, Islamicity Index and Malaysian Shariah Index. Those indexes were used as indicators to measure performance and the seriousness of executing groups in implementing principles which have been agreed collectively [19].

Based on observation, the aforementioned indexes point at elemental measurements related to the implementation and practices of *maqasid shariah* in everyday's life. Meanwhile, Tawhidic Paradigm Index aims at measuring the implementation and practices of tawhidic paradigm comprising creed, sharia and moral based on theoretical and practical knowledge, faith and practices in order to achieve al Falah in the world and hereafter.

## 2. Literature Review

### 2.1 Etymology of Tawhidic Paradigm

Tawhidic Paradigm rooted from two different words that carried their own meanings. Nevertheless, when the words are being put together, they indicate a whole new interesting meaning that is worth researching. The word paradigm was first introduced by Thomas Kuhn in his work *The Structure of Scientific Revolution* [22]. He presented the paradigm as a shifting theory which was known as Paradigm Theory, he later used the theory specifically in behavioral science studies [26]. According to Kuhn, the development of knowledge does not happen cumulatively but revolutionary therefore paradigm serves as the keyword in the context of knowledge development [1].

A few scholars like Hans Küng insist that the word paradigm is applicable for use in other realms of studies like religion as well as social studies. He later introduced the concept of Paradigm Analysis through his books *Does God Exist? The Problem of God in the Modern World* (1978: 16 years after the publication of Kuhn's book) and *Theology for the Third Millennium* (1987). It was further developed into his book entitled 'Global Responsibility' (1991) which for the first time brought the theme of global ethics as a concept of peace strategy among religions with paradigm analysis in use [26].

In contrast, Hassan Langgulung, through his work "Paradigm Shift in Islamic Education and Social Science (2002), provided a different explanation compared to what was earlier given by Kuhn in terms of the meaning of paradigm. He noted that paradigm functions as a light in which scholars can notify and comprehend the issues in their respective scholarly studies. The understanding of the issues may then lead to them getting answers of the issue emerged [1].

Based on several insights that are mentioned by scholars, hence it can be summarized that the word paradigm has gone through a series of semantic evolution in line with the development of knowledge. In respect to the research, the authors use the meaning of paradigm as a framework of thoughts of an organization that is existingly influenced by experience, knowledge, skills and awareness.

Linguistically, Tauhid derived from the word وَحْدٌ which means as indivisible or oneness, the word later is widely used to convey the concept of monotheism [40] [41]. Tauhid is a sign of profession of faith to the one and only God [12]. Tauhid is also defined as religion's central and single most important comprehensive concept, upon which a Muslim's entire faith rests (Roni Ismail, 2014). It is a pillar, knowledge that reflects the declaration of belief in the oneness of God. The concept is divided into 3 basic tenets: faith, knowledge, and practise [38].

Al Faruqi in his book entitled *Al Tawhid: Its Implications for Thought and Life* has made a very in depth writing about Tauhid, apart from explaining the meaning of Tauhid as a oneness ((There is no god but God), he also portrayed Tauhid as a world view. Therefore, Tauhid is a general view on reality, truth, world, space and time, human history and the fate of human life. In addition to that, tauhid is also a gist to Islamic Civilization and the religion itself [5]. He also integrated the Tauhid principles with other worldly knowledge such as politics, economics, social, society, history, metaphysics, ethics, and aesthetics [5]. He managed to place Tauhid as an important element for humans in the world and hereafter [4].

Abu Said al-Kharraz sums that the word Tauhid with three main elements: First, physical declaration of the oneness of Allah SWT and the assertion of Prophet Muhammad pbuh as the messenger of Allah. Second, both declarations are pronounced and asserted undoubtedly. Third, to observe all practices are not against the command of Allah SWT. Next, the believer should follow the practices of the prophets and their disciples sincerely. As the three elements are fulfilled, then only a believer can become impeccable in terms of his faith, Islam, and belief (*Tauhid*).

Audah Mannan (2018) defined the Tawhidic concept not only on the aspect of faith but on the wide aspect of life including science and technology. Tauhid is a human commitment to God and is a focal point that admits the sense of obedience, gratefulness and other noble values [6] [23]. In this context Tauhid acts as the only source that leads humans to the existence of God regardless of their whereabouts.

M. Hasbi (2009) [23] remarks that the integrity of the Tawhidic concept will not be reached if the interpretation of worship to God is dichotomously divided with the meaning of moral and social commitment amongst humans. They are not merely as the "sky" but also "earth" which means it does not only involve the faith in God in terms of the substance, nature and command of God, it is more on

faith, knowledge, perception and thoughts about God. Meanwhile, Practical Tauhid is more related towards the practise of humans lives in the world, social etiquette and culture [29].

Overall, the views can be summarized as; Tauhid brings about three vast elements that comprises belief, faith and practices which can also be referred as ethics. The combination of all three will mould into a Tawhidic personality who leaves positive impacts towards oneself as well as the environment she/he lives in.

As both words; paradigm and tawhidic are merged they produce a very integrative concept that is Tawhidic Paradigm. Based on observation it can be concluded that tawhidic paradigm means both theoretical and practical aspects that discuss a theoretical thinking framework about the oneness of Allah. It also can be viewed in the aspect of its practicality that encompasses ethics and behaviour related to Allah SWT. In addition, faith towards the oneness of Allah SWT emerges in the form of sacred behaviour and personality which hold a firm belief in the Tawhidic principles.

## 2.2 Tawhidic paradigm

According to Muhammad Naim (2019) [25] the formation of tawhidic paradigm are based on the fundamental concept as explained by al-Qardhawi (1993) [38] which are faith, knowledge and practices. Tawhidic concept gives value into paradigm which initially consists of assumption or empty dogma. Furthermore, tawhidic paradigm is seen as a concept that strengthens an individual belief based on faith [27] Through tawhidic paradigm approach, it can give strength and advantages towards the quality of decision making [25].

The understanding and observation of tawhidic paradigm not only focus on theoretical framework only. The integration between theory and practice, spirit and intellect along with soul and courtesy guarantee the effectiveness of a decision and action that is taken by a believer.

Tan Sri Professor Dr Kamal Hassan (2010) [21] defines tawhidic paradigm as an Islamic monoteisme thinking in which relates to how human should live and fill his/her duty as a faithful who possess honorable character (*'ibād al-Rahmān*), leadership (*khulafā' fī al-ard*), believer (al-mu'minūn) in order to translate a better human life (*khaira ummatin ukhrijat lil-Nās*) (Quran 3:110) as well as a balanced society (*ummatan wasatan li takūnūshuhadā' 'ala al-nās*) (Quran 3:143). Obviously, the definition given by him projects a clear character and practices that any human being should have in his/her life in this world in order to lead an eternally peaceful and balanced life in this world and in the hereafter.

Tawhidic paradigm is an understanding of practices in parallel with faith (*'aqīdāh*), worship (*'ibadah*), and ethics (*akhlāq*) in a life as a believer and leader [34]. Joni (2000) makes a comprehensive conclusion of the tawhidic paradigm whereby it serves as a framework that strengthens the relationship between a believer and Allah SWT [20]. It is also a human liberation from other beings as well a truthful expression of obedience to the one and only God; Allah SWT. Apart from preserving a good relationship with Allah SWT and mankind, tawhidic paradigm also stresses the relationship between mankind and the environment. Through a good relationship mankind will embrace good ethics and abstain from doing any misdeeds. It also consolidates the concept of obedience towards Allah SWT command and refraining from doing His prohibition. The obedience concept is a causal effect that emerges from the understanding and the execution of a holistic mission [20].

In the context of knowledge, al-Attas and al-Faruqi agreed to establish the tawhidic paradigm as an acceptable and practical tawhidic thinking frameworks for all branches of knowledge. All forms of

knowledge, be it new or old, need to coexist with tawhidic paradigm concepts [33]. Audah (2018) also poses that tawhidic paradigm as a thinking platform (*qiyadah fikriyah*) for all existing knowledge branches [6]. However, if they contradict with the concept they have to be rejected. Simply, all form of knowledge must lead a follower to the straight path leading him/her to discover the one and only God apart from shaping ones to be a better human.

### 2.3 Application of Tawhidic Paradigm in Multidisciplinary Knowledge

In response with the thinking framework of tawhidic paradigm, other realms or research emerged which aim at applying the concept in the respective expertise. Based on the researcher observation there are three main common research areas related to tawhidic paradigm. The researcher, however, will only discuss some examples in each of the areas to show how practical tawhidic paradigm is.

### 2.4 Education

M Hasbi (2010) did research on the relation of the role of tawhidic paradigm in solving the issue of education among Islamic studies students at a religious school [23]. According to him the main problem with Islamic studies is that the education on it only highlights the theoretical aspect hence the education imparted to students did not motivate students to practice the knowledge in their daily lives. In order to solve the issue, M.Hasbi suggested the tawhidic paradigm to be the pillar of education, which is comprehensive and practical in nature. Only with doing so, it can leave a significant impact in character building and pious students

The integration of tauhid in life dimension is comprehensive in nature has led to a discovery that epistemologically tawhidic paradigm has an intact relationship with knowledge [13]. The research centred around al-Faruqi thought summed that all human's knowledge about the reality of life are subjected to the position of the absolute oneness of God. In this regard, in studying for any knowledge, moslems are urged to free themselves from the viruses of skepticism, secularism, relativism and positivism as they are perilous threat against knowledge [13].

The Tawhidic paradigm was also researched in terms of its connection with science and theology. Saifullah (2000) explains the need to study science and technology in Islamic perspective. In this context Audah (2018) emphasized that in tawhidic concepts, the field of science and technology are fundamentally based on godly values as the ethical basis. In addition, all activities are grounded based on humanistic and godly values. Tawhidic paradigm as a basis in the development of science leads to the formation of godly concepts in a more specific manner. The world and its content are always seen as evidence of god's might [6]. Knowledge in the latter form will produce a unity between science and spiritual knowledge [30]. The integration between the *aqli* and *naqli* element will eventually produce physically, spiritually, emotionally and intellectually well-balanced individual. As a result, it can shape a generation with a solid tawhidic paradigm.

Research is not something unfamiliar in education. There are various research methodologies that advocate the use of tawhidic paradigm approach. Suhaimi Mhd Sarif (2018) argues that recent qualitative research does not have philosophical research questions driven by tawhidic paradigm [35]. Researchers are dependent on alternative dynamism in intellectual contemporary and philosophical research to answer the world uncertainties and complexities. This shows that there are several effects toward qualitative research dynamism. Research outcomes exhibit that tawhidic paradigm dynamism-led in qualitative research are in the phase of demonstrating, explaining, exploring events, individuals,

groups, institutions and organisation in deductive parameter and tawhidic measurement. Indeed, tawhidic paradigm dynamisme enables the acquisition of knowledge, modelling, application and systematic and pragmatic adoption.

## 2.5 Economics and Management

Tawhidic paradigm promotes tawhidic framework through integration method. It evidently has universal and flexible character. There is several research conducted by scholars in the field of economy and management. Joni (2000) highlighted the relationship between tawhidic paradigm in the context of Islamic banking. There are eight Tawhidic based Islamic banking economy principles philosophy namely; Allah as the absolute owner, the concept of humans as caliphates, justice concept, integration of morals with economics activities, positive outlook toward economics activities and development, wealth redistribution orientated by values,removal of interests rate and the sharing of profit and loss system. The tawhidic paradigm practices in Islamic banking has managed to differentiate it with modern banking which is largely based on usury. The Islamic banking has more advantages over modern banking owing to the fact that Islam eliminates the cruelty of ursury, emphasizes the moral and social integration in economics activities,shares profit and loss contract and implements al-'adl concept in banking activities and services [20].

Entrepreneurship is one of an important area that drives the development of the country's economy. Entrepreneurs play significant roles in order to materialize the aforementioned vision. However, in achieving the mission they have to have outstanding ethics as Farah Akmar & Anor Salima (2018) explained that the awareness to achieve well-being (*falāh*) in life and excellence (*itqān*) in professionalism can be gained through tawhidic paradigm. Research findings indicate the tawhidic paradigm is able to leave a compelling impact in the development of integrated curriculum tailored for entrepreneurs. In consequence from the research findings, Farah Akmar & Anor Salima continued to research further by relating it to law principles. The findings suggested that entrepreneurship curriculum integrated with tawhidic paradigm and knowledge in law is able to produce successful and resilient entrepreneurs [10].

Yusuf Ismail dan Suhaimi Mhd Sarif (2011) described the importance of tawhidic paradigm in management transformation towards management system.The research deliberates the main components of tawhidic paradigm beside illustrating the connection of tawhidic spirit with management functions that involve planning, organization, leaders and monitoring. All tawhidic paradigms integrated with management functions should align with the needs of the worldly and hereafter life. Through spiritual awareness, a management system implemented continuously can achieve the mission and objectives of a firm by executing values stimulating goodness and deterring from misdeeds.

## 2.6 Leadership

Leadership is an important aspect in determining the success or failure of an organisation [24]. A good number of researchers agreed that values in leaders and subordinates are core to effective leadership [14]. Hersey (1982) on the other hand pointed out leadership means a process affected by human activities conducted in order to achieve objectives in an organization. A leader has to be responsible in ensuring the quality and effectiveness of scheduling so that everything is aligned with planning earlier done beside meeting set deadlines [36].

Leadership has been also related to the tawhidic paradigm concept. Bahrom (2008) conducted a study pertaining to the importance of tawhidic approach which seen as a more holistic leadership pattern compared to other existing leadership theory. Its approach emphasizes humans' relationship with Allah, humans and environment is particularly special in tawhidic leaders. The development of leadership model with tawhidic paradigm as its core enables the development of well-balanced human capital [15].

### 3. Research Methodology

Overall, the research utilized Exploratory Sequential Mix Metthe hod (spelling\_ approach. It is an approach that combines qualitative and quantitative data collection and analysis following the specified phases [8]. Elizabeth Berman (2017) reiterates, the approach is characterized by a couple of phases. The first phase involved the collection and analysis of qualitative and quantitative data while the final phase is consolidating and connecting the data from both methods earlier mentioned [9].

Since the research was conducted to explain the concept of tawhidic paradigm in theoretical (qualitative) and measurable (quantitative) form therefore Exploratory Sequential Mixed Method is determined as the most relevant to produce highly valid research.

**Table 1:** Four Phases Tawhidic Paradigm Index

Phase 1	Exploring Tawhidic Paradigm Element (Qualitative)
Phase 2	Evaluation of Construct Suitability and Tawhidic Paradigm Element (Quantitative)
Phase 3	Testing of Tawhidic Paradigm Model using Principal Component Analysis (PCA)
Phase 4	Application of Tawhidic Paradigm Index (Quantitative)

Based on the above table, it clearly indicates the development of paradigm index went through a process involving two approaches namely, qualitative and quantitative in line with the method utilizing Exploratory Sequential Mixed Method. Wisdom J dan Creswell JW (2013) mentioned that the use of the mix method has various advantages including the retrieval of rich and comprehensive data of which those data can be compared qualitatively and quantitatively. Additionally, the method is reflective, it provides participants the opportunity to voice out their opinion based on the research conducted as well as ensuring the data is based on their experience [37].

### 4. Research Location

The research was conducted for its very first time at Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia (UTHM) before it's being extended to other parties who might have interest in the area. UTHM is a public university whose niche area is in technical studies, and it emphasizes tawhidic paradigm in its mission statement. The mission explains UTHM is committed in establishing and disseminating knowledge to fulfill the industrial and community needs as well as nourishing creative and innovative human capital based on tawhidic paradigm. Hence, the mission clearly represents UTHM aim to produce well balanced

graduates in line with the National Education Philosophy (NEP). The Tawhidic paradigm has to be viewed in terms of its practicality and how it is measured. Thus, the research has been successful in producing a measuring tool recognized by experts in terms of its validity. The tool clarifies the meaning of tawhidic paradigm in a more theoretical and practical form with an additional ability to measure and evaluate data collected.

## 5. Conclusions

Generally, the tawhidic paradigm has been understood as an immeasurable holistic and abstract concept. Nevertheless, this research has managed to prove that the word “paradigm” brought about a comprehensive meaning comprising its theoretical and practical nature. Thus, it demonstrates that the concept can be measured. Research pertaining to the development of Tawhidic Paradigm Index (TPI) is an effort to produce a measuring tool to measure the implementation of tawhidic paradigm concept applied in an organization. The management will be informed of the percentage of the practice of tawhidic paradigm in its organization. This is due to the fact that tawhidic paradigm index does not mean the measurement of tawhidic paradigm knowledge per individual however it measures the extent of which an environment of an organization motivates its members to observe the tawhidic practices specified. Apart from helping the management in identifying the implementation level of the concept, the measurement and evaluation of the concept also assists the management to determine the causes of any weaknesses rooted within the organization. Apart from that the method can also help the management to strategize for improvements based on data collected through the approach. This research is hoped to materialize the concept of treating job tasks as a form of ibadah to subsequently achieve al-Falah in the world and hereafter.

## Acknowledgments

This work is ostensibly supported by University Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia (UTHM) under Research Management Centre, grant H001. We also would like to thank those who have given contributions for this research

## References

- [1] Aam Abdussalam (2011), Paradigma Tauhid: Kajian Paradigma Alternatif Dalam Perkembangan Ilmu dan Pembelajaran Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam-Ta’lim 9 113-126
- [2] Abdul Aziz Ismail (2006), Ilmu Tauhid Membentuk Peribadi Mukmin (Kuala Lumpur: Al-Hidayah Publishers)
- [3] Abu Said al-Kharraz (2014), The Book Of Truthfulness:Kitab al-Sidq Terj: Arthur John Arberry (Petaling Jaya: Islamic Book Trust)
- [4] Ahmad Sabri bin Osman et al (2012), Prinsip Tauhid Ideasional dalam Hubungan Islam dan Agama-Agama Lain: Analisis Peranannya Menurut Isma’il Raji Al Faruqi Jurnal Intelek UiTM Perlis 7 46-56
- [5] Al Faruqi I.R. (1992), Al Tawhid: Its Implications for Thought and Life Virginia: International Institute of Islamic Thought.



- [6] Audah Mannan (2018), Transformasi Nilai-Nilai Tauhid dalam Perkembangan Sains dan Teknologi Jurnal Akidah 4 252-268
- [7] Baharom Mohammad et al (2008), Pendekatan Tauhid Dalam Kepimpinan Pendidikan Kertas Kerja Seminar Kebangsaan Pengurusan Pendidikan PKPGB: Universiti Teknologi Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia pp 1-13
- [8] Creswell J. W. and Plano Clark V. L. (2018), Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research Thousand Oaks (CA: SAGE)
- [9] E Berman (2017), An Exploratory Sequential Mixed Methods Approach to Understanding Journal of eScience Librarianship 6 1-24 e1098, 10.7191/jeslib.2017.1098
- [10] Farah Akma et al (2019), Developing entrepreneurship training curriculum based on Tawhidic paradigm and legal principles: A case study of Malaysia Journal of Economics, Management and Sustainability 4 30-39 doi10.14254/jems.2019
- [11] Farah Akmar Anor Salima et al (2018), Introspecting Entrepreneurship from a Tawhidic Perspective, Management & Accounting Review 17 1-20
- [12] Fawzan S. (2005), Concise Commentary on The Book of Tawheed (Riyadh: Maiman Publishing House)
- [13] Firda Inayah (2018), Tauhid sebagai Prinsip Ilmu Pengetahuan: Studi Analisis Ismail Raji al Faruqi, TASFIYAH Jurnal Pemikiran Islam 2 97-121 <http://dx.doi.org/10.21111/tasfiyah.v1i2.2484>
- [14] Gary Yukl (2008), How Leaders Influence Organizational Effectiveness: The Leadership Quarterly 19 pp 708-722
- [15] Hailan Salamun dan Asyraf Ab Rahman Pertimbangan Ketuhanan Dalam Kepimpinan Politik Rabbani Masyarakat Melayu Proc. of ICIC2015 Int. Conf. on Empowering Islamic Civilization in the 21st Century 6-7 September 2015 Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin, Malaysia
- [16] Hassan Langgulung (2002), Peralihan Paradigma Dalam Pendidikan Islam dan Sains Sosial (Jakarta: Gaya Media Pratama)
- [17] Hersey P. and Blanchard K. H. (1982), Management of Organisation Behaviour : Utilizing Human Resources Englewood Cliffs (NJ: Prentice Hall)
- [18] Indeks Paradigma Tauhid UTHM (with English Subtitle) 2019 [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=i\\_ucukBERQY](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=i_ucukBERQY)
- [19] Indeks Syariah Malaysia: Model Tadbir Urus Berteraskan Maqasid Syariah (2015), (Putrajaya: Jabatan Kemajuan Islam Malaysia)
- [20] Joni Tamkin (2000), The Tawhidic Paradigm in Islamic Banking Jurnal Usuluddin 11 45-58
- [21] Kamal Hassan (2010), A Return to the Quranic Paradigm Development and Integrated Knowledge: The Ulul Albab Model Intellectual Discourse 18 183-210
- [22] Kuhn and Thomas S (1970), The Structure of Scientific Revolutions (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press)

- [23] M.Hasbi (2009), Konsep Tauhid Sebagai Solusi Problematika Pendidikan Agama bagi Siswa Madrasah Jurnal Pemikiran Alternatif Pendidikan INSANIA 14 289-319
- [24] Mitra Mandanchian et.al (2017), Leadership Effectiveness Measurement and Its Effect on Organizations Outcomes *Procedia Engineering* 181 1043-48
- [25] Mohammad Naim Abd Halim et al (2019), Paradigma Tauhid Dalam Kepimpinan Islam: Satu Ulasan *Journal of Humanities, Language, Culture and Business (HLCB)* 3 125-139
- [26] Mohd Khairul Naim (2018), Analisis Teori Paradigma Hans Küng dalam Kajian Agama Afkar 20 143-178
- [27] Muhammad Isa Selamat (1996), Sifat-sifat Allah dan Mentauhidkan Diri Kepada-Nya (Kuala Lumpur: Darul Nu'man)
- [28] Muhammad Zainal Abidin (2016), Paradigma Islam Dalam Pembangunan Ilmu Integralistik: Membaca Pemikiran Kuntowijoyo (IAIN: Antasari Press)
- [29] Muthahhari dan Murtadha (1992), Allah dalam Kehidupan Manusia (Bandung: Mizan)
- [30] Osman Bakar (1991), Tawhidic and Science: Secretariat for Islamic Philosophy and Science (Kuala Lumpur: Nurin Enterprise)
- [31] Roni Ismail (2014), Hakikat Monotheisme Islam: Kajian Atas Konsep Tauhid "LAA ILAAHA ILLALLAH" *Jurnal Studi Agama-Agama* 10 172-183
- [32] Saifullah Bhutto et al (2000), Is Islam and Science Against? *Indian Journal of Science and Technology* 13 1148-1159 DOI: 10.17485/ijst/2020/v13i10/149741
- [33] Solihah Zikri (2017), A Comparative Analysis of The Conceptions of Muhammad Naquib Al-Attas and Ismail Raji Al-Faruqi in Islamization of Knowledge 2 17-36
- [34] Suhaimi Mhd Sarif (2014), Tawhidic Paradigm and Organizational Policy and Strategy Practices Southeast Asia *Journal of Contemporary Business, Economics and Law* 5 28-35
- [35] Suhaimi Mhd. Sarif (2018), Effects of Tawhidic paradigm dynamism in qualitative research *Journal of Education and Social Sciences* 9 66-72
- [36] Wan Azmi Ramli (1981), Pengurusan (Kuala Lumpur: Utusan Publications)
- [37] Wisdom J and Creswell JW (2013), Mixed Methods: Integrating Quantitative and Qualitative Data Collection and Analysis While Studying Patient-Centered Medical Home Models (Rockville MD: AHRQ Publication)
- [38] Yusuf Al-Qardhawi (1993), Pengertian Tauhid (Kuala Lumpur: Pustaka Salam Sdn.Bhd)
- [39] Ismail, Y. & Sarif, S.M The Role of Tawhidic Paradigm in the Transformation of Management System in Zulkepli Abd Ghani et al Proc. of the National Seminar on Islamic Management Systems Transformation 1-2 October 2011 Islamic Science University Malaysia (USIM), PWTC, Kuala Lumpur
- [40] Zulkifli Muhammad al Bakri (2014), Definisi Tauhid Irsyad Al-Fatwa Bil 1
- [41] Zulkifli Muhammad al Bakri (2019), Tauhid dan Martabatnya Menurut Imam Al Ghazali Al Afkar Bil 55